

# Dissension amongst the Parliamentary Labour Party, 2008-2009

## A Data Handbook



**Philip Cowley**  
and  
**Mark Stuart**

E·S·R·C  
ECONOMIC  
& SOCIAL  
RESEARCH  
COUNCIL



The University of  
**Nottingham**

[revolts.co.uk](http://revolts.co.uk)



## Contents

Introduction	1
I Backbench rebellions and rebels, 2008-2009	8
II List of all Labour rebellions, 2008-2009	32
III Major rebellions against the party whip, by issue/bill	35
Coroners and Justice Bill	35
Heathrow and Gurkhas	37
Welfare Reform Bill	39
Parliamentary Standards Bill	41
IV The Labour Rebels	42
Sorted by number of rebellions	42
Sorted alphabetically	46

As always, we are grateful to the various bodies that have helped support our research on backbench behaviour – most obviously the University of Nottingham who fund the current research – and to the many MPs who have responded to our plentiful queries. We also thank Andy Platt who photoshopped Postman Pat and his Gurkha Van. Copies of this pamphlet and other material on backbench dissent are available free of charge from [www.revols.co.uk](http://www.revols.co.uk).

## Introduction

The fourth session of this Parliament (and Gordon Brown's second complete session as Prime Minister) saw Labour MPs defy their whips on 74 occasions. In raw terms, this was a drop on the 103 of the previous session, although still enough to constitute the fourth most rebellious session faced by New Labour's whips, and the ninth most rebellious since 1945.

This raw figure, though, is slightly misleading, as there was a noticeable drop in the number of divisions taking place, from 341 in 2007-8, to 248 in 2008-9. Measured as a percentage of divisions, the 74 revolts equate to a rebellion in 30 percent of divisions, exactly the same as the preceding session's figure. Each of the four sessions of the 2005 Parliament, therefore, has now seen a rebellion rate of between 20 and 30 percent, and the Parliament as a whole is currently averaging a rate of 27 percent, on course to become the most rebellious in the post-war era. Even if the Parliament's final session sees relative calm – as final sessions usually do – we still expect the 2005 parliament easily to break the post-war record, set by the 2001-05 Parliament, of a rebellion in 20.8 percent of divisions. In absolute terms, that record has already been achieved; the 2005 Parliament has already seen more revolts against the whip by members of the governing party than any other post-war parliament.

The rebellions in the 2008-9 session covered a wide range of issues and bills: from prostitution to parliamentary standards; from local government to income tax; from marine conservation to bingo duty; from the Gurkhas to Iraq; from immigration to ID cards; from inquests to control orders; and from welfare reform to Equitable Life.

As in previous sessions, the good news for the whips was that most of the rebellions to take place during the 2008-09 session were not large: the mean was just over nine (up slightly on a figure of eight in the previous session). The median was just six (up from four in 2007-08). Some 42 out of the 74 revolts consisted of fewer than ten Labour MPs.

Two revolts shared the honours (if that is the right word) for being the largest. On 17 March, during the Report Stage of the Welfare Reform Bill, 30 Labour MPs backed a clause in the name of Lynne Jones that would have abolished the lower rate of Jobseeker's Allowance for 18-25 year olds. But Conservative support for the Government's position ensured a comfortable victory in the division lobbies. Then, towards the end of the session, on 9 November 2009, as the Commons discussed Lords Amendments to the Coroners and Justice Bill, 30 Labour backbenchers supported an amendment in the name of Andrew Dismore that would have deleted provisions suspending a coroner's inquest in favour of a secret inquiry under the provisions of the Inquiries Act 2005. In this case, the Government's majority was reduced to just eight.

A total of 102 Labour MPs voted against their whips during the session (down very slightly from 104 the previous session, and down on the 122 in 2006-07 and the 114 in 2005-06). But eleven Labour MPs did so for the first time ever since Labour entered government: Gordon Banks, Margaret Beckett, Ian Cawsey, Jim Dowd, Tom Harris, Shona McIssac, John Reid, Virendra Sharma, Andrew Slaughter, Dari Taylor and Mark Todd. A further five – Graham Allen, David Borrow, Karen Buck, Parmjit

Dhanda and David Kidney - cast their first votes against Gordon Brown's leadership, although all five had already rebelled under Tony Blair. They bring the total number of Labour rebels under Brown to 137. Rebellion remains concentrated amongst a small group of Labour MPs. The top ten rebels in the 2008-09 session accounted for marginally under half (46%) of the total rebellious votes cast; the top 20 rebels accounted for exactly two-thirds (66%) of the total. Both figures are somewhat greater - by five and eight percentage points respectively - than in the preceding session.

Of the 50 top most rebellious MPs under Blair, just two - Dr Roger Berry and Betty Williams - have yet to defy Brown's leadership in the division lobbies. John McDonnell took the top spot as the most rebellious Labour MP in the fourth session, clocking up 46 dissenting votes. He was closely followed by Jeremy Corbyn on 45. Corbyn's total number of votes against the whip for the Brown administration alone has now passed the 100 mark, with more than 400 in total since 1997.

\*\*\*

The government suffered two defeats during the session as a result of its backbenchers defying the whip.<sup>1</sup> On 29 April 2009, Gordon Brown suffered his first Commons defeat as Prime Minister, when 27 Labour MPs supported a Liberal Democrat Opposition Day motion calling for improved settlement rights for Gurkha veterans. The Liberal Democrat motion, which also enjoyed Conservative frontbench support, was carried by 267 votes to 246, a majority against the Government of twenty-one. At least 70 Labour MPs are thought to have abstained or been absent from the vote.

Then, on 1 July 2009, 25 Labour MPs opposed a Government motion during the Committee stage of the Parliamentary Standards Bill that would have permitted parliamentary debates to be used in court as evidence. The motion was defeated by 250 votes to 247, a majority against the Government of three. The rebels that day included Margaret Beckett, the former Foreign Secretary, and John Reid, the Home Secretary, both casting their first ever dissenting votes against the Government since 1997.

Gordon Brown thus continued the sequence, since Heath in the 1970s, of Prime Ministers suffering at least one defeat as a result of backbench dissent.

Even before this second Commons defeat, however, the Government had begun to engage in a series of U-turns on key aspects of its policy programme. On 30 June, the Government announced that its ID cards scheme would remain voluntary, with plans for compulsory ID cards for pilots and other airport workers shelved. The following day, the Business Secretary, Peter Mandelson, abandoned the Government's plans to part-privatise the Royal Mail, blaming the lack of a private sector buyer. The reality was that the shelving of the Postal Services Bill was a

---

<sup>1</sup> The Government also suffered one other Commons defeat, caused not by Labour MPs voting against the whip, but backbench dissent, but because the whips failed to muster sufficient Labour MPs to vote in the division lobbies. On 25 June 2009, a Government motion providing for a meeting of the East Midlands Regional Grand Committee in Nottingham during the summer recess was defeated by 104 votes to 98 (Div. 159). The defeat was subsequently reversed on 15 July 2009 (Div. 201) - and the people of Nottingham rejoiced.

classic example of Labour backbench power, led in this case by the former Work and Pensions Secretary, Peter Hain. Some 146 Labour MPs had signed an EDM supporting 'a wholly publicly-owned integrated Royal Mail Group' and rejecting 'the recommendation of the Hooper Report to sell a minority stake in Royal Mail which would risk fracturing one of Britain's greatest public services'. The whips had been arguing privately for either delay or outright abandonment long before Mandelson finally killed the measure off.

The whips also faced a new second front, as rebellious Labour backbenchers started supporting Conservative and Liberal Democrat Opposition Day motions. Since Gordon Brown became Prime Minister in June 2007, there have been 23 separate Labour rebellions on Opposition Days. Compare that with the first Blair Parliament from 1997 to 2001, when there were only two Labour rebellions on Opposition Days involving only two MPs. In this session alone, there were 14 separate Labour rebellions on Opposition Days, averaging 12 Labour dissenters per vote, and accounting for just under one fifth of the total number of rebellions this session. The defeat over the Gurkhas on 29 April 2009 (mentioned above) was only the most high profile example of this. On 28 January 2009, a Conservative Opposition Day motion calling for the abandonment of the third runway at Heathrow attracted 28 Labour rebels, the highest ever number to rebel on an Opposition Day since Labour came to power in 1997, and enough to reduce the Government's majority to just nineteen.

In the course of 2009, both main Opposition parties became adept at crafting motions on controversial topics in order to cause maximum embarrassment to the Government. On 25 March, 13 Labour MPs supported a Conservative Opposition Day motion calling for an inquiry into the war in Iraq; even when the Government conceded this, by 24 June, 19 Labour MPs were joining the two Opposition parties in urging that the inquiry be held in public, something which the Government conceded only few days later. On 21 October 2009, 18 Labour MPs supported a Liberal Democrat Opposition Day motion calling for compensation for the victims of the collapse of Equitable Life; the same day saw 12 Labour backbenchers support a Lib Dem call for Government bodies to implement a 10% reduction in carbon emissions by 2010 (as part of the so-called '10:10' campaign).

Not only does the Government Whips' Office have to contend with rebellions on contentious legislation, but also on motions on topics carefully crafted by the Opposition to cause maximum embarrassment to the Government.

By the end of the session, the threat of another defeat on an Opposition Day was sufficient for the Government to announce yet another U-turn, this time over plans to cut the training budget of the Territorial Army. Staring down the barrel of yet another Liberal Democrat Opposition Day debate calling for the cuts to be fully restored, and following a phone call between the Prime Minister and John Reid, the former Defence Secretary, a leading opponent of the cuts, the Government reversed its original decision.

\*\*\*

This volume is a record of all the occasions which separated members of the Parliamentary Labour Party from their leadership. It provides brief details of all 74 rebellions by Labour backbenchers between 3 December 2008 and 12 November 2009, along with full lists of every MP to participate in each of those rebellions. It is unlikely to be the most exciting volume you will ever read in your life. But it is not

meant to be exciting. It is meant as a reference work, something to be checked occasionally for relevant information, and then put back on the shelf, or deleted from the PC.

We hope it might be useful for those voters who want to know what their MP did (or didn't do) during the last parliament, as well as for those – researchers, academics, lobbyists, journalists – who want to know about the behaviour of the PLP during the period. We do not pretend that this is the story of the 2008-09 session – the full story is, thankfully, far more interesting than this – but it is at least some of the raw material of that story, and is here for others to use, in the future, however they want.

We list here every occasion during the 2008-09 session when a Labour MP voted against his or her whip. This is a deceptively simple statement – but there are a handful of important caveats which need to be understood if the data are to make sense.

The first is that we have excluded 'free votes', those occasions on which the Labour party managers, the whips, did not issue instructions to the PLP. That means, for instance that in this particular session, we do not include a series of votes on 30 April 2009, where MPs voted on MPs' expenses and allowances (Divs. 106-109). Nor did we include votes on the Youth Parliament sitting in the Chamber (16 March, Divs. 71-73). Or votes on 'hybrid bills' (a mix between public and private bills) dealing with various city councils, or divisions relating to Christmas, Easter and May adjournments or ecclesiastical matters. All these experienced minor Labour splits, but they are considered to be House of Commons or procedural matters where the whips generally do not overtly interfere.

This volume is therefore not a record of every occasion when a Labour MP deviated from the rest of his or her party; it is a record of every occasion when Labour MPs defied the whip to do so. This differentiates this data source from some of the (otherwise excellent) web-based search engines that are available (such as [publicwhip.org.uk](http://publicwhip.org.uk) or [theyworkforyou.com](http://theyworkforyou.com)), which record all occasions when a party's MPs are not 100% united.<sup>2</sup> Our interest here is on matters of dissent, on those occasions where MPs defy their party leadership. For one thing, there is a qualitative difference between voting against your party when the whip is on, and doing so when it is not. In addition, not differentiating whipped from unwhipped votes can lead to strange conclusions about an MP's behaviour.

It is sometimes difficult to distinguish definitively between whipped and genuinely free votes – hence the problem that the websites have - and there is a tricky middle ground, where the vote may not be officially whipped but where it is quite clear what the party hierarchy want their MPs to do. As one whip put it: there are 'free votes and free votes'. For instance, on 8 December 2008 (Div. 2), 29 Labour MPs supported an amendment in the name of Sir Menzies Campbell that sought to

---

<sup>2</sup> There is one other problem with the various web-based sources on MPs' voting. When a party's official line is to abstain, they fail to detect MPs who are breaking their whip to vote on an issue (either for or against). This is usually less of a problem for the government – since it is extremely rare for the government to be neutral on an issue – but it can be a much more serious problem when analysing the behaviour of MPs from opposition parties. And it can prove a problem with government MPs too.

broaden the scope of the Speaker's Committee inquiry into the Damian Green affair. Although that issue was technically a House of Commons matter, the Government did not want to see the Speaker's Committee range too widely, so there may have been a bit of unofficial whipping going on. The Government was certainly relieved to have won the vote by a majority of just four. Similarly, on 17 December 2008 (Div. 10), 26 Labour MPs objected to the remuneration package of the Chairman of the Electoral Commission. Technically, this was a House of Commons matter, but we can speculate as to the extent to which the whips were involved in ensuring the success of this particular vote. Neither of these occasions is included in our data because there is no conclusive evidence that they were in fact subject to an official whip.

But based both on contacts with MPs and with whips, we believe that we have identified all those occasions when Labour MPs defied the official instructions of their whips. The result is that, if anything, we are *understating* the level of Labour backbench division in this session.

The second caveat is that we have excluded from our list of rebels those occasions when MPs vote twice. One of the most common reasons for this happening is to register an abstention. The procedures of the House of Commons give MPs just two formal options: to vote aye or no on whatever question is before them. MPs occasionally get around this by voting in both lobbies. This practice – which was deprecated by the Speaker – is known by some Labour MPs as 'Skinner abstentions', after the veteran Labour MP, and frequent rebel, Dennis Skinner. It is a curious nomenclature. Skinner is by inclination not the abstaining type – and (as far as we are aware) has never voted in both lobbies to register an abstention. It would be much more sensible to call them 'Taylor abstentions' after the Labour MP for Leicestershire North West, David Taylor, who began to engage in the practice fairly regularly during the 2001 parliament as a way of casting what he called a 'positive abstention' (and, as will be clear in what follows, it is a practice he has continued to pursue).<sup>3</sup> We do not include such MPs in our lists of rebels – or in our overall figures – but we have recorded their presence in notes each time it has occurred.

MPs also sometimes vote in both lobbies as a way of correcting an initial vote cast in error, rushing back through the other lobby once they realise their mistake. As the Labour MP Paul Flynn notes in his wonderful book, *Commons Knowledge*, 'outsiders guffaw at the possibility of MPs voting the wrong way. After all the choice is simple, yes or no'. But with around 300 votes each year, MPs do not know all the details about each vote they cast, especially on the more arcane amendments; so, as Flynn

---

<sup>3</sup> In the 2001-05 Parliament, Taylor cast a total of 21 deliberate abstentions; the first four sessions of the 2005 Parliament have already seen 32 such votes, six coming the 2008-09 session. The habit of registering a deliberate abstention in this way seems to be spreading much wider among the PLP: three Labour MPs – Andrew Mackinlay, Kelvin Hopkins and Dr Lynne Jones – each cast two deliberate abstentions during 2008-09, while a further nine Labour backbenchers have also deliberately voted in both lobbies in this session, five of them on whipped votes, four on free votes. The practice has also spread to the Opposition parties, with Mike Hancock continuing his habit (begun at the beginning of the Parliament) of voting in both lobbies when the Liberal Democrat frontbench line is to abstain. Four other Liberal Democrats have also double-voted in this session, as has Robert Wareing, the former Labour MP, Dr Richard Taylor, the Independent, and Bob Spink, the former Conservative, now UKIP, MP, who has voted in both lobbies on eight occasions.



puts it, they are 'grateful for the sheepdog herding of the Whips who direct them safely into the lobby of righteousness and truth'.<sup>4</sup> But sometimes the herding breaks down, and the MP gets directed into the wrong lobby. Voting can be a particular problem for Liberal Democrats and those from minor parties because they both often lack the sight of masses of their colleagues flooding into one lobby, but it happens to MPs of all parties.

Lastly, there are also those occasions when *Hansard* – the official record of parliamentary debates – simply mis-records an MP's vote. Again, where, with the help of the MPs concerned, we have been able to identify such mis-recorded votes we have excluded them from the data.<sup>5</sup>

Perhaps most importantly, of all, however, we are not able to record all the occasions when MPs defy their whips by abstaining, rather than voting against. Because the House of Commons does not allow MPs to register abstentions – other than, as discussed above, by voting twice – it is not possible to read anything into absences. The whips may have formally sanctioned an absence from a vote; it may be accidental; or it may be deliberate. There is no information on the record that allows us to establish, at least not systematically, the causes of absences. Where the information is available, we do provide a note of the numbers believed to be abstaining in any particular vote. But even here, we are not able to read anything into the behaviour of those who were absent from both votes.

\*\*\*

We are very grateful for the MPs who helped us with the research, research of which this volume is just one part. MPs get bombarded with academic requests for assistance – from school children, students, and academics – and yet nearly all of them took the time to help clear up, or explain, what had taken place on a particular vote. We are also grateful for the assistance of the government whips' office, for similar help in determining the whipping arrangements on some votes. Many MPs helped further, by granting interviews, the material from which we intend to use in further (more interesting) publications.

The research reported here was conducted as part of a research project, which is currently funded by the University of Nottingham, where the authors are based, and we are grateful for their support.

The pamphlet is in four main sections.

Section I (pp. 8 to 31) contains a listing of every rebellion by Labour MPs between 2008 and 2009, giving an explanation of each vote and listing the backbench rebels.

---

<sup>4</sup> Paul Flynn, *Commons Knowledge*, Seren, 1997, p. 16.

<sup>5</sup> For example, on 11 November 2009, Helen Jones, the Government whip, was incorrectly recorded as acting as a teller in both the aye and no lobbies. Two days before, Tom Harris (the Labour MP) had been confused with Evan Harris (the Liberal Democrat) and recorded as voting against his party whip. The House authorities spotted the latter, and corrected it online and in the bound editions, but – as he recorded on his blog – not before colleagues of Tom Harris had begun to question him about why he had voted against the government. All such cases are excluded from our analysis.

Section II (pp. 32 to 34) contains summary tables of all 74 rebellions, giving issue, date, division number and size of rebellion.

Section III (pp.35 to 41) contains tabulations of each of the issues to see significant rebellions during the session.

Section IV (pp. 42 to 49) provides totals for the number of dissenting votes cast by each Labour MP, listing MPs by both the total number of dissenting votes cast, and alphabetically.

We have made every effort to ensure that the information contained in this volume is correct, but in the event that we have made mistakes, we would, of course, welcome the chance to correct them. We can be contacted at either [info@revolts.co.uk](mailto:info@revolts.co.uk) or [philip.cowley@nottingham.ac.uk](mailto:philip.cowley@nottingham.ac.uk).

November 2009

## **I Backbench rebellions and rebels, 2008-2009**

*3 December 2008-12 November 2009*

**[1]** 8 December 2008 (Div. 1):

Five Labour MPs voted in favour of a Conservative Opposition frontbench amendment that sought to double the length (from three hours to six hours) of the proposed debate on the Speaker's Committee report into the arrest of Damian Green, the Conservative MP for Ashford:

Paul Farrelly  
Mark Fisher  
Paul Flynn  
Bob Marshall-Andrews  
Gordon Prentice

*Note:* Former Labour MP Clare Short also voted in favour of the Conservative amendment.

**[2]** 17 December 2008 (Div. 9):

Three Labour backbenchers voted in favour of a Liberal Democrat Opposition prayer, annulling a cut in VAT from 17.5% to 15%:

Frank Field  
Kelvin Hopkins  
Austin Mitchell

**[3]** 26 January 2009 (Div. 21):

Two Labour MPs voted in favour of a Liberal Democrat Reasoned Amendment, declining to support the Second Reading of the Coroners and Justice Bill, because it provided for inquests in private and without a jury in some cases:

Jeremy Corbyn  
John McDonnell

**[4]** 26 January 2009 (Div. 24):

Two Labour MPs voted against a statutory instrument, which amended the Criminal Justice and Police Act 2001, reclassifying cannabis from a Class C to a Class B drug, and introducing fines for possession of cannabis:

Dr Brian Iddon  
Gordon Prentice

**[5]** 28 January 2009 (Div. 26):

Twenty-eight Labour MPs supported a Conservative Opposition Day motion, criticising the Government's plans to build a third runway at Heathrow airport:

Diane Abbott	Kate Hoey	Gordon Prentice
Harry Cohen	Kelvin Hopkins	Nick Raysnford
Jeremy Corbyn	Dr Lynne Jones	Martin Salter
Jim Cousins	Peter Kilfoyle	Virendra Sharma
Frank Dobson	Andrew Mackinlay	Alan Simpson
David Drew	Bob Marshall-Andrews	Andrew Slaughter
Frank Field	John McDonnell	Andrew Smith
Paul Flynn	Michael Meacher	David Taylor
Dr Ian Gibson	George Mudie	
John Grogan	Chris Mullin	

*Notes:* The motion was defeated by 297 votes to 278, a Government majority of 19. The division saw the largest rebellion by Labour MPs on an Opposition Day since New Labour came to power in 1997. Two PPSs – Andrew Slaughter and Virendra Sharma – resigned prior to the vote. Two former Labour MPs - Clare Short and Robert Wareing - also voted against the Government.

**[6]** 24 February 2009 (Div. 40):

One Labour MP voted in favour of a Conservative Opposition Day motion calling on the Government to introduce unambiguous food labelling, stating the country of origin of the major ingredients, believing that this would create a level playing field for British farmers:

Alan Simpson

**[7]** 3 March 2009 (Div. 49):

Sixteen Labour MPs voted against the annual renewal of control orders, contained in the draft Prevention of Terrorism Act 2005 (Continuance in force of sections 1-9) order 2009:

Katy Clark	Kate Hoey	Gordon Prentice
Jeremy Corbyn	Kelvin Hopkins	Linda Riordan
David Drew	Dr Lynne Jones	Alan Simpson
Mark Fisher	Bob Marshall-Andrews	Dennis Skinner
Paul Flynn	John McDonnell	
Dr Ian Gibson	Michael Meacher	

*Notes:* Diane Abbott and Andrew Mackinlay cast deliberate abstentions by voting in both lobbies. Former Labour MPs, Clare Short and Robert Wareing, also voted against the order. The Conservative frontbench line was to abstain, but three Conservative backbenchers – Douglas Hogg, Richard Shepherd and Robert Walter voted in the no lobby against the order.

**[8]** 4 March 2009 (Div. 53):

Two Labour MPs supported a Conservative backbench amendment (in the name of Peter Bone) to a Government allocation of time motion that would have allowed two days instead of one for the discussion of the Northern Ireland Bill:

Kate Hoey  
Andrew Mackinlay

**[9]** 11 March 2009 (Div. 58):

In a deferred division, one Labour MP opposed a Government motion taking note of a Second Strategic Energy Review, conducted by the European Commission:

Alan Simpson

*Notes:* The Conservative frontbench line was to abstain, but two pro-European Conservatives – John Gummer and Ian Taylor – supported the Government in the aye lobby, while five Euro-sceptic Conservatives – William Cash, Mark Field, John Hayes, John Redwood and Richard Shepherd – voted in the no lobby against the motion. The Liberal Democrat line was to oppose the motion, but two of their MPs – Tim Farron and Willie Rennie – supported the Government in the aye lobby.

**[10]** 17 March 2009 (Div. 74):

In the joint-largest rebellion of the session, during the Report stage of the Welfare Reform Bill 30 Labour MPs supported a new clause in the name of Dr Lynne Jones that would have abolished the lower rate of Jobseeker's allowance for 18-25 year olds:

Colin Burgon	Neil Gerrard	Eric Martlew
Ronnie Campbell	Dr Ian Gibson	John McDonnell
Martin Caton	Roger Godsiff	Austin Mitchell
Katy Clark	John Grogan	Gordon Prentice
Frank Cook	Dai Havard	Linda Riordan
Jeremy Corbyn	Kate Hoey	Alan Simpson
Jim Cousins	Kelvin Hopkins	Dennis Skinner
Frank Dobson	Dr Brian Iddon	David Taylor
David Drew	Dr Lynne Jones	Paul Truswell
Paul Flynn	Peter Kilfoyle	Mike Wood

*Notes:* John McFall, the Chairman of the Treasury Select Committee, initially voted in favour of the amendment by mistake, later entering the opposite lobby to cancel out his vote. Former Labour MP, Robert Wareing also voted in favour of the new clause. The Conservatives supported the Government in the no lobby, ensuring that the new clause was defeated by 408 votes to 85.

**[11]** 17 March 2009 (Div. 75):

During the Report Stage of the Welfare Reform Bill, 26 Labour MPs supported an amendment in the name of John McDonnell that would have rendered 'work for benefit' proposals in the bill an offer rather than an imposition:

Colin Burgon	David Drew	Gordon Prentice
Ronnie Campbell	Paul Flynn	Linda Riordan
Martin Caton	Neil Gerrard	Alan Simpson
Katy Clark	John Grogan	Dennis Skinner
Frank Cook	Dai Havard	David Taylor
Jeremy Corbyn	Kate Hoey	Paul Truswell
Jim Cousins	Kelvin Hopkins	David Winnick
John Cummings	Dr Lynne Jones	Mike Wood
Frank Dobson	John McDonnell	

*Notes:* Former Labour MP, Robert Wareing also voted for the amendment. The Conservative frontbench line was to support the Government, but one Conservative MP – Richard Shepherd – voted with the Liberal Democrats and the Labour rebels in the aye lobby. The Government won the vote by 396 to 76.

**[12]** 17 March 2009 (Div. 76):

During the Report stage of the Welfare Reform Bill, 29 Labour MPs supported a Conservative frontbench amendment that would have prevented the work-related requirements in the bill from applying to a single parent with a child under five:

Colin Burgon	David Drew	Michael Meacher
Ronnie Campbell	Paul Flynn	George Mudie
Katy Clark	Neil Gerrard	Gordon Prentice
David Clelland	Dr Ian Gibson	Linda Riordan
Frank Cook	Dai Havard	Alan Simpson
Jeremy Corbyn	Kate Hoey	David Taylor
Jim Cousins	Kelvin Hopkins	Paul Truswell
Jon Cruddas	Dr Lynne Jones	David Winnick
John Cummings	Peter Kilfoyle	Mike Wood
Frank Dobson	John McDonnell	

*Notes:* Former Paymaster-General, Geoffrey Robinson appears to have cast a deliberate abstention by voting in both lobbies. The former Labour MP, Robert Wareing, also voted in favour of the amendment.

**[13]** 23 March 2009 (Div. 82):

Two Labour backbenchers opposed the third programme motion for the Coroners and Justice Bill:

Jeremy Corbyn  
John McDonnell

**[14]** 23 March 2009 (Div. 83):

During the Report stage of the Coroners and Justice Bill, 19 Labour MPs supported a Liberal Democrat amendment that would have removed a clause providing for inquests to be held in private, and without a jury in some cases:

Diane Abbott	Neil Gerrard	Andrew Mackinlay
Colin Burgon	John Grogan	John McDonnell
Ronnie Campbell	Dai Havard	Gordon Prentice
Jeremy Corbyn	Kelvin Hopkins	Alan Simpson
Andrew Dismore	Glenda Jackson	Paul Truswell
Frank Dobson	Dr Lynne Jones	
Mark Fisher	Peter Kilfoyle	

*Notes:* Former Labour MP, Robert Wareing, also voted against the Government. The Government won the vote by 263 votes to 229, more or less halving their majority to 34.

**[15]** 24 March 2009 (Div. 84):

During the Report stage of the Coroners and Justice Bill, ten Labour MPs supported an amendment in the name of David Taylor that would have had the effect of reinserting a free speech clause to an offence prohibiting incitement of hatred on the grounds of sexual orientation:

David Drew	Kate Hoey	David Taylor
Frank Field	Peter Kilfoyle	Dr Tony Wright
John Grogan	Greg Pope	
Tom Harris	Geraldine Smith	

*Notes:* The ten Labour rebels were joined by two Liberal Democrats – Sir Alan Beith and Tim Farron – in the aye lobby, alongside the whole of the Conservative parliamentary party, apart from John Bercow, who voted with the Government in the no lobby. The amendment was heavily defeated by 328 votes to 174.

**[16]** 24 March 2009 (Div. 87):

One Labour MP opposed the Third Reading of the Coroners and Justice Bill:

Paul Farrelly

**[17]** 25 March 2009 (Div. 88):

Thirteen Labour MPs supported a Conservative Opposition Day motion calling for an inquiry into the war in Iraq:

Harry Cohen  
Jeremy Corbyn  
Paul Flynn  
Roger Godsiff  
Kelvin Hopkins

Dr Lynne Jones  
Andrew Mackinlay  
John McDonnell  
Gordon Prentice  
Linda Riordan

Alan Simpson  
Sir Peter Soulsby  
Mike Wood

*Notes:* David Taylor and Paul Truswell cast deliberate abstentions by voting in both lobbies. Former Labour MP, Robert Wareing also voted against the Government. The Government won the vote by 303 votes to 265, a majority of 38.

**[18]** 25 March 2009 (Div. 89):

Twelve Labour MPs opposed a Government amendment to a Conservative Opposition Day motion, which recognized that 'a time will come when an inquiry [into the war in Iraq] is appropriate' but declining 'to make a proposal for a further inquiry at this time':

Jeremy Corbyn  
Paul Flynn  
Roger Godsiff  
Kelvin Hopkins

Dr Lynne Jones  
Andrew Mackinlay  
John McDonnell  
Gordon Prentice

Linda Riordan  
Alan Simpson  
Sir Peter Soulsby  
Mike Wood

*Notes:* David Taylor cast a deliberate abstention by voting in both lobbies. Former Labour MP, Robert Wareing also voted against the Government. The Government won by 301 votes to 265, a majority of 36.



**[19]** 1 April 2009 (Div. 95):

Four Labour MPs supported a Conservative Opposition Prayer attempting to annul retrospective rating charges on firms operating in British ports:

Ian Cawsey  
Frank Field  
Shona McIssac  
Austin Mitchell

*Note:* The Conservative frontbench abstained on their own prayer, but the Labour MPs listed above – all representing constituencies with ports – insisted upon a division.

**[20]** 29 April 2009 (Div. 104):

In Gordon Brown's first Commons defeat as Prime Minister, 27 Labour MPs supported a Liberal Democrat Opposition Day motion calling for improved settlement rights for Gurkha veterans. The Liberal Democrat motion, which enjoyed Conservative frontbench support, was carried by 267 votes to 246, *a majority against the Government of 21*:

Diane Abbott	Joan Humble	Stephen Pound
Ian Cawsey	Glenda Jackson	Nick Raynsford
Harry Cohen	Andrew Mackinlay	Andy Reed
Jeremy Corbyn	Gordon Marsden	Linda Riordan
Paul Farrelly	Bob Marshall-Andrews	Alan Simpson
Mark Fisher	John McDonnell	Andrew Smith
Neil Gerrard	Shona McIssac	Paul Truswell
Kate Hoey	Julie Morgan	Keith Vaz
Kelvin Hopkins	Dr Nick Palmer	Mike Wood

*Notes:* At least 70 Labour MPs are thought to have abstained or been absent from the vote. David Taylor cast a deliberate abstention by voting in both lobbies, while former Labour MP, Robert Wareing also voted against the Government.

**[21]** 13 May 2009 (Div. 126):

During the Committee stage of the Finance Bill, one Labour MP supported a Liberal Democrat amendment that would have introduced a remote rural fuel discount scheme:

David Drew

**[22]** 13 May 2009 (Div. 129):

During the Committee stage of the Finance Bill, three Labour MPs supported an SNP amendment that would have reduced Bingo Duty from 22% to 15%:

David Drew  
Roger Godsiff  
Kelvin Hopkins

*Note:* Former Labour MP, Robert Wareing, also voted in favour of the SNP amendment in the aye lobby.

**[23]** 18 May 2009 (Div. 132):

Six Labour MPs supported a Conservative Opposition Day motion, calling for an independent inquiry into failings at Mid-Staffordshire NHS Foundation Trust:

Janet Dean  
Paul Farrelly

Mark Fisher  
David Kidney

David Taylor  
Joan Walley

*Note:* Former Labour MP, Clare Short, also voted in favour of the Opposition motion.

**[24]** 19 May 2009 (Div. 133):

Four Labour MPs voted against the second programme motion for the Policing and Crime Bill:

Jeremy Corbyn  
Dr Lynne Jones  
John McDonnell  
Gordon Prentice

*Notes:* Former Labour MP, Clare Short, also voted against the programme motion. UKIP MP, Bob Spink, cast a deliberate abstention by voting in both lobbies.

**[25]** 19 May 2009 (Div. 134):

During the Report stage of the Policing and Crime Bill, six Labour MPs supported a Liberal Democrat New Clause that would have permitted the destruction within one month of any DNA samples taken from someone released without charge or acquitted of an offence:

Jeremy Corbyn  
Dr Lynne Jones

John McDonnell  
Gordon Prentice

Alan Simpson  
Keith Vaz

*Notes:* Mike Wood cast a deliberate abstention by voting in both lobbies. Former Labour MP, Clare Short also voted in favour of the Liberal Democrat New Clause.

**[26]** 19 May 2009 (Div. 136):

During the Report stage of the Policing and Crime Bill, 11 Labour MPs voted in favour of a Liberal Democrat New Clause that would have decriminalised prostitution for those under the age of 18:

Jeremy Corbyn  
Neil Gerrard  
Dr Ian Gibson  
Kate Hoey

Dr Brian Iddon  
Glenda Jackson  
Dr Lynne Jones  
John McDonnell

Austin Mitchell  
Alan Simpson  
Dennis Skinner

*Notes:* Former Labour MP, Clare Short, also voted in favour of the Liberal Democrat New Clause. The Conservative frontbench line was to abstain. Two Conservative MPs – Richard Shepherd and Anthony Steen – voted in favour of the New Clause, while another two – John Gummer and Edward Leigh – voted against.

**[27]** 19 May 2009 (Div. 137):

During the Report stage of the Policing and Crime Bill, 12 Labour MPs voted in favour of a Liberal Democrat New Clause that would have introduced a new offence of paying for the sexual services of a prostitute known to be trafficked or coerced:

Diane Abbott  
Jeremy Corbyn  
David Drew  
Frank Field

Neil Gerrard  
Kate Hoey  
Dr Brian Iddon  
Glenda Jackson

Dr Lynne Jones  
John McDonnell  
Alan Simpson  
Mike Wood

*Notes:* Former Labour MP, Clare Short, also voted in favour of the Liberal Democrat New Clause. The Conservative frontbench line was to support the New Clause, but three Tory backbenchers – John Bercow, John Gummer and Edward Leigh – voted against it.

**[28]** 20 May 2009 (Div. 138):

Eighteen Labour MPs supported a Labour backbench amendment in the name of John McDonnell that would have made contentious national policy statements relating to planning subjected to a Commons debate of up to three hours, followed by a vote:

Colin Burgon	Dai Havard	Gordon Prentice
Jeremy Corbyn	Kate Hoey	Linda Riordan
David Drew	Dr Lynne Jones	Alan Simpson
Mark Fisher	Mark Lazarowicz	David Taylor
Dr Ian Gibson	John McDonnell	Paul Truswell
John Grogan	Austin Mitchell	Mike Wood

*Note:* Former Labour MPs, Clare Short and Robert Wareing, also voted in favour of the amendment in the aye lobby.

**[29]** 20 May 2009 (Div. 139):

Eight Labour MPs opposed the Government's national policy statements relating to planning issues:

Jeremy Corbyn	Dr Lynne Jones	Alan Simpson
Dai Havard	John McDonnell	Paul Truswell
Kate Hoey	Gordon Prentice	

*Note:* Former Labour MP, Robert Wareing, also voted against the Government.

**[30]** 17 June 2009 (Div. 151):

In a deferred division, one Labour MP opposed a Government motion taking note of a European Union Document on the development of the External Service:

David Drew

**[31]** 17 June 2009 (Div. 153):

Eight Labour MPs supported a Lords amendment to the Business Rate Supplements Bill that would have prevented Business Rate Supplements (BRS) from being levied retrospectively on firms operating out of British ports:

Ian Cawsey	Frank Field	Austin Mitchell
David Drew	John McDonnell	Gwyn Prosser
Louise Ellman	Shona McIssac	

**[32]** 24 June 2009 (Div. 155):

Nineteen Labour MPs supported a Conservative Opposition Day motion calling for the Committee of Inquiry into the War in Iraq to be held, whenever possible, in public:

Jeremy Corbyn  
Parmjit Dhanda  
David Drew  
Paul Farrelly  
Frank Field  
Mark Fisher  
Paul Flynn

Roger Godsiff  
Kate Hoey  
Kelvin Hopkins  
Dr Lynne Jones  
Andrew Mackinlay  
Bob Marshall-Andrews  
John McDonnell

Gordon Prentice  
Alan Simpson  
Sir Peter Soulsby  
Dr Gavin Strang  
Mike Wood

*Notes:* The Government's majority fell to 39. Two former Labour MPs – Clare Short and Robert Wareing – also voted against the Government.

**[33]** 24 June 2009 (Div. 156):

Eleven Labour MPs opposed a Government amendment to a Conservative Opposition Day motion, which commended the proposal by the Chair of the Inquiry into the War in Iraq to hold as much of the proceedings as possible in public without compromising national security:

Jeremy Corbyn  
David Drew  
Paul Flynn  
Roger Godsiff

Kelvin Hopkins  
Andrew Mackinlay  
Bob Marshall-Andrews  
John McDonnell

Gordon Prentice  
Alan Simpson  
Dr Gavin Strang

*Notes:* David Taylor cast a deliberate abstention by voting in both lobbies. Two former Labour MPs – Clare Short and Robert Wareing – also voted against the Government.

**[34]** 29 June 2009 (Div. 167):

One Labour backbencher opposed the Second Reading of the Parliamentary Standards Bill:

Frank Field

*Notes:* The Conservative frontbench line was to abstain, but one Tory backbencher – Philip Hollobone – supported the Bill, while two Conservative MPs – David Heathcoat-Amory and Richard Shepherd – opposed it.

**[35]** 29 June 2009 (Div. 168):

One Labour MP opposed the programme motion for the Parliamentary Standards Bill:

Kate Hoey

**[36]** 1 July 2009 (Div. 175):

During the Committee stage of the Parliamentary Standards Bill, six Labour MPs supported a Conservative frontbench amendment that would have removed the power of the new Independent Parliamentary Standards Authority to make recommendations to the House about possible disciplinary sanctions:

Diane Abbott  
Mark Fisher

Doug Henderson  
Alan Meale

Alan Simpson  
Gisela Stuart

*Notes:* Kelvin Hopkins cast a deliberate abstention by voting in both lobbies, as did Liberal Democrat MP, Andrew George. Former Labour MP, Robert Wareing, also voted against the Government.

**[37]** 1 July 2009 (Div. 177):

During the Committee stage of the Parliamentary Standards Bill, one Labour MP supported a Conservative frontbench amendment that would have removed the new offence of prohibiting paid advocacy:

Alan Simpson

*Note:* The Liberal Democrat line was to oppose the amendment, but two Lib Dem MPs – Sir Alan Beith and Lembit Opik – supported the amendment in the aye lobby.

**[38]** 1 July 2009 (Div. 178):

During the Committee stage of the Parliamentary Standards Bill, 25 Labour MPs opposed a Government 'stand part' motion that would have permitted parliamentary debates to be used in court as evidence. The motion was defeated by 250 votes to 247, a majority against the Government of three:

Diane Abbott  
John Austin  
Margaret Beckett  
David Borrow  
Jeremy Corbyn  
Andrew Dismore  
Jim Dowd  
David Drew  
Mark Fisher

Paul Flynn  
Kelvin Hopkins  
Dr Lynne Jones  
Andy Love  
Fiona Mactaggart  
Alan Meale  
Dr Doug Naysmith  
Greg Pope  
Gordon Prentice

John Reid  
Virendra Sharma  
Alan Simpson  
Gisela Stuart  
David Taylor  
Dr Rudi Vis  
Mike Wood

*Note:* Former Labour MP, Robert Wareing also voted against the Government.

**[39]** 1 July 2009 (Div. 179):

During the Report stage of the Parliamentary Standards Bill, one Labour MP supported a Conservative frontbench amendment that would have introduced a sunset clause, allowing the provisions to expire in a year's time:

Frank Field

**[40]** 6 July 2009 (Div. 182):

Four Labour MPs supported a Conservative Opposition Day motion calling for the Government's identity cards scheme to be cancelled immediately:

Jeremy Corbyn  
Roger Godsiff  
Kate Hoey  
John McDonnell

*Note:* Three Labour MPs – Kelvin Hopkins, Andrew Mackinlay and David Taylor – cast deliberate abstentions by voting in both lobbies, as did UKIP MP, Bob Spink.

**[41]** 6 July 2009 (Div. 183):

Nine Labour MPs opposed a Government amendment to a Conservative Opposition Day motion, noting that any decision on whether membership of the ID cards scheme should be compulsory would require further legislation:

Jeremy Corbyn  
David Drew  
Paul Flynn

Roger Godsiff  
Kate Hoey  
Kelvin Hopkins

Andrew Mackinlay  
David Taylor  
Mark Todd

*Note:* UKIP MP, Bob Spink cast a deliberate abstention by voting in both lobbies.

**[42]** 7 July 2009 (Div. 184):

During the Report stage of the Finance Bill, 18 Labour MPs voted in favour of a Labour backbench New Clause in the name of Frank Field that would have compensated all those adversely affected by the abolition of 10p rate of income tax:

Diane Abbott  
Martin Caton  
Jeremy Corbyn  
David Drew  
Frank Field  
Mark Fisher

Paul Flynn  
Roger Godsiff  
Dai Havard  
Kate Hoey  
Kelvin Hopkins  
Dr Lynne Jones

Peter Kilfoyle  
Andrew Mackinlay  
John McDonnell  
Gordon Prentice  
Alan Simpson  
Mike Wood

*Note:* Two former Labour MPs – Clare Short and Robert Wareing – also voted against the Government.

**[43]** 7 July 2009 (Div. 186):

During the Report stage of the Finance Bill, one Labour MP supported a Liberal Democrat amendment that would have increased personal allowances from £6,475 to £10,000:

John McDonnell

*Notes:* The Conservative frontbench line was to abstain, but two Tory backbenchers – Philip Davies and Philip Hollobone – voted in favour of the amendment. Two former Labour MPs – Clare Short and Robert Wareing – also voted against the Government in the aye lobby.



**[44]** 7 July 2009 (Div. 187):

During the Report stage of the Finance Bill, one Labour MP supported a Liberal Democrat amendment that would have reduced the rate of alcoholic liquor duty by 2 percent per year:

John McDonnell

*Notes:* The Conservative frontbench line was to abstain, but one Tory MP – Philip Hollobone – voted in favour of the amendment. Former Labour MP, Robert Wareing, also voted against the Government in the aye lobby.

**[45]** 8 July 2009 (Div. 188):

In a deferred division, three Labour backbenchers opposed the draft Justice and Security (Northern Ireland) Act 2007 (Extension of non-jury trial provisions) Order 2009:

Jeremy Corbyn  
John McDonnell  
Alan Simson

*Note:* The Conservative frontbench line was to support the draft order, but one Tory backbencher – Richard Shepherd – voted against it, joining the no lobby.

**[46]** 8 July 2009 (Div. 189):

In a deferred division, fourteen Labour MPs opposed the draft Identity Cards Act 2006 (Provision of Information without Consent) Regulations 2009:

Diane Abbott  
Colin Challen  
Jeremy Corbyn  
Jim Devine  
David Drew

Neil Gerrard  
Dr Lynne Jones  
Andrew Mackinlay  
John McDonnell  
Albert Owen

Alan Simpson  
David Taylor  
Mark Todd  
David Winnick

**[47]** 8 July 2009 (Div. 190):

In a deferred division, fourteen Labour MPs opposed the draft Identity Cards Act 2006 (Information and Code of Practice on Penalties) Order 2009:

Diane Abbott	Neil Gerrard	Alan Simpson
Colin Challen	Dr Lynne Jones	David Taylor
Jeremy Corbyn	Andrew Mackinlay	Mark Todd
Jim Devine	John McDonnell	David Winnick
David Drew	Albert Owen	

**[48]** 8 July 2009 (Div. 191):

In a deferred division, thirteen Labour MPs opposed the draft Identity Cards Act 2006 (Fees) Regulations 2009:

Diane Abbott	Neil Gerrard	David Taylor
Colin Challen	Dr Lynne Jones	Mark Todd
Jeremy Corbyn	Andrew Mackinlay	David Winnick
Jim Devine	John McDonnell	
David Drew	Alan Simpson	

**[49]** 8 July 2009 (Div. 192):

In a deferred division, fourteen Labour MPs opposed the Identity Cards Act 2006 (Application and Issue of ID Card and Notification of Changes) Regulations 2009:

Diane Abbott	Neil Gerrard	Alan Simpson
Colin Challen	Dr Lynne Jones	David Taylor
Jeremy Corbyn	Andrew Mackinlay	Mark Todd
Jim Devine	John McDonnell	David Winnick
David Drew	Albert Owen	

**[50]** 8 July 2009 (Div. 193):

In a deferred division, fourteen Labour MPs opposed the draft Identity Cards Act (Prescribed Information) Regulations 2009:

Diane Abbott	Neil Gerrard	Alan Simpson
Colin Challen	Dr Lynne Jones	David Taylor
Jeremy Corbyn	Andrew Mackinlay	Mark Todd
Jim Devine	John McDonnell	David Winnick
David Drew	Albert Owen	

**[51]** 8 July 2009 (Div. 195):

During the Report stage of the Finance Bill, 17 Labour MPs supported an SNP amendment that would have reduced the duty on bingo from 22% to 15%:

Ronnie Campbell	Patrick Hall	Denis Murphy
Jeremy Corbyn	Kate Hoey	Alan Simpson
John Cummings	Kelvin Hopkins	Dari Taylor
David Drew	Eric Illsley	David Taylor
Frank Field	Dr Lynne Jones	Anthony Wright (Great Yarmouth)
Roger Godsiff	John McDonnell	

*Notes:* The Conservative frontbench line was to abstain, but five Tory backbenchers – Peter Bone, Sir Patrick Cormack, John Gummer, Philip Hollobone and the newly-elected MP for Crewe and Nantwich, Edward Timpson – voted in favour of the SNP amendment. Two former Labour MPs – Clare Short and Robert Wareing – also voted in the aye lobby against the Government.

**[52]** 9 July 2009 (Div. 196):

Five Labour backbenchers opposed the draft Terrorism Act (Disapplication of Section 25) Order 2009:

Jeremy Corbyn  
Dr Lynne Jones  
Andrew Mackinlay  
John McDonnell  
Alan Simpson

**[53]** 9 July 2009 (Div. 197):

Two Labour MPs opposed the draft Council Tax Limitation (Maximum Amounts) (England) Order 2009:

Jeremy Corbyn  
John McDonnell

**[54]** 14 July 2009 (Div. 200):

During the Report stage of the Borders, Citizenship and Immigration Bill, six Labour MPs supported a Liberal Democrat New Clause that would have enshrined in law the policy changes the Government agreed to implement on 21 May 2009 with regard to Gurkhas who had retired from the British army before 1997:

Jeremy Corbyn	Bob Marshall-Andrews	Alan Simpson
David Drew	John McDonnell	Keith Vaz

**[55]** 15 July 2009 (Div. 202):

Ten Labour MPs supported a Conservative Opposition Day motion calling for a review of the Extradition Act 2003:

Jeremy Corbyn  
Jim Devine  
Paul Flynn  
Kate Hoey

Dr Lynne Jones  
Andrew Mackinlay  
John McDonnell  
Mohammad Sarwar

Alan Simpson  
Keith Vaz

**[56]** 21 July 2009 (Div. 208):

During the Lords amendments stage of the Parliamentary Standards Bill, one Labour MP supported a Conservative backbench amendment in the name of William Cash that would have inserted into Clause 1 the words 'notwithstanding any provision of the European Communities Act 1972, the European Convention on Human Rights or the Human Rights Act 1998':

Frank Field

**[57]** 12 October 2009 (Div. 210):

During the Report stage of the Health Bill, three Labour MPs supported a Conservative frontbench New Clause that would have made it a criminal offence to purchase cigarettes on behalf of a minor:

Claire Curtis-Thomas  
Roger Godsiff  
Alan Simpson

*Note:* Jim McGovern appears to have cast a deliberate abstention by voting in both lobbies.

**[58]** 12 October 2009 (Div. 212):

During the Report stage of the Health Bill, four Labour MPs supported a Conservative frontbench amendment that would have removed Clause 21 – the ban on displays of tobacco products at the point of sale:

Frank Field  
Roger Godsiff  
Tom Harris  
Kate Hoey

*Notes:* The Labour side was whipped, but both the Conservatives and the Liberal Democrats permitted free votes. Only two Conservative MPs – Greg Clark and Sir George Young – opposed the amendment, while only two Liberal Democrats – Bob Russell and Stephen Williams – also opposed it.

**[59]** 13 October 2009 (Div. 213):

During the Report stage of the Local Democracy, Economic Development and Construction Bill, four Labour backbenchers supported a Plaid Cymru New Clause that would have enhanced insolvency protection for small-to-medium-sized enterprises:

Jeremy Corbyn  
David Drew  
John McDonnell  
Paul Truswell

**[60]** 13 October 2009 (Div. 214):

During the Report stage of the Local Democracy, Economic Development and Construction Bill, 14 Labour MPs supported a Labour backbench New Clause in the name of Andrew Mackinlay that would have given local councils with populations of up to one million, the choice whether to re-introduce a committee system, abolished by the Local Government Act 2000 for councils with populations of more than 85,000:

Diane Abbott  
Ronnie Campbell  
David Clelland  
Jeremy Corbyn  
David Drew

Roger Godsiff  
Kelvin Hopkins  
Andrew Mackinlay  
Eric Martlew  
John McDonnell

Alan Simpson  
Sir Peter Soulsby  
David Taylor  
Paul Truswell

**[61]** 13 October 2009 (Div. 215):

During the Report stage of the Local Democracy, Economic Development and Construction Bill, ten Labour MPs supported a Labour backbench New Clause in the name of David Drew that would have forced all local councils to produce a local spending report within twelve months of the passage of the Act complying with the Sustainable Communities Act 2007:

Diane Abbott  
Jeremy Corbyn  
David Drew  
Kelvin Hopkins

Dr Lynne Jones  
John McDonnell  
Gordon Prentice  
Alan Simpson

David Taylor  
Paul Truswell

**[62]** 21 October 2009 (Div. 228):

Eighteen Labour MPs supported a Liberal Democrat Opposition Day motion which called on the Government to accept the recommendations of the Parliamentary Ombudsman on compensating Equitable Life policyholders who have suffered financial losses:

Gordon Banks  
Ian Cawsey  
Jeremy Corbyn  
Paul Farrelly  
Frank Field  
Patrick Hall

Kate Hoey  
Kelvin Hopkins  
Dr Lynne Jones  
Mark Lazarowicz  
John McDonnell  
Shona McIssac

Julie Morgan  
Albert Owen  
Alan Simpson  
Paul Truswell  
Mike Wood  
Dr Tony Wright

*Notes:* The Government's majority was halved to 35. Former Labour MP, Robert Wareing also voted in favour of the Liberal Democrat motion.

**[63]** 21 October 2009 (Div. 229):

Twelve Labour MPs supported a Liberal Democrat Opposition Day motion that called upon the Government and all public sector bodies to come up with a delivery plan to achieve a 10% reduction in greenhouse gas emissions by the end of 2010:

Colin Challen  
Jeremy Corbyn  
David Drew  
Neil Gerrard

Kate Hoey  
Kelvin Hopkins  
Dr Lynne Jones  
John McDonnell

Dr Nick Palmer  
Alan Simpson  
David Taylor  
Paul Truswell

*Notes:* Former Labour MP, Robert Wareing, also voted in favour of the Liberal Democrat motion. Four DUP members supported the motion, but one – Sammy Wilson – voted against it.

**[64]** 26 October 2009 (Div. 230):

During the Report stage of the Marine and Coastal Access Bill, 11 Labour MPs supported a Labour backbench amendment in the name of Katy Clark that would have strengthened the minister's powers to designate Marine Conservation Zones (MCZs):

Katy Clark  
Jeremy Corbyn  
David Drew  
Neil Gerrard

Dr Lynne Jones  
Bob Marshall-Andrews  
John McDonnell  
Linda Riordan

David Taylor  
Paul Truswell  
Joan Walley

**[65]** 28 October 2009 (Div. 232):

Two Labour backbenchers supported a Conservative Opposition Day motion which called upon the Government to publish local spending reports in accordance with the Sustainable Communities Act 2007:

Jeremy Corbyn  
Alan Simpson

**[66]** 3 November 2009 (Div. 234):

Four MPs voted against the programme motion for the Constitutional Reform and Governance Bill:

Kate Hoey  
Dr Lynne Jones  
Andrew Mackinlay  
Bob Marshall-Andrews

*Note:* Former Labour MP, Clare Short also voted against the programme motion.

**[67]** 3 November 2009 (Div. 235):

During the Committee stage of the Constitutional Reform and Governance Bill, four Labour MPs voted in favour of a Liberal Democrat amendment that would have included GCHQ Cheltenham within the remit of the civil service provisions in the bill:

Jeremy Corbyn  
John McDonnell  
Gordon Prentice  
Alan Simpson

*Note:* Dr Tony Wright, who spoke in favour of the amendment during the debate, appears to have abstained.

**[68]** 4 November 2009 (Div. 239):

During the Report stage of the Constitutional Reform and Governance Bill, one Labour MP supported a Conservative frontbench amendment that would have insisted that the pay, allowances and expenses of the Comptroller and Auditor General be published online monthly:

Dennis Skinner

**[69]** 9 November 2009 (Div. 240):

One Labour MP voted against the fourth programme motion for the Coroners and Justice Bill:

Bob Marshall-Andrews

*Note:* Former Labour MP, Clare Short, also voted against the programme motion.

**[70]** 9 November 2009 (Div. 241):

In the joint-largest rebellion of the session, during consideration of Lords amendments, 30 Labour MPs supported an amendment in the name of Andrew Dismore to the Coroners and Justice Bill that would have deleted the provisions suspending a coroner's inquest in favour of a secret inquiry under the provisions of the Inquiries Act 2005:

Diane Abbott  
Graham Allen  
John Austin  
Karen Buck  
Colin Burgon  
Martin Caton  
Colin Challen  
Katy Clark  
Jeremy Corbyn  
Andrew Dismore

Frank Dobson  
David Drew  
Paul Farrelly  
Frank Field  
Mark Fisher  
Neil Gerrard  
John Grogan  
Dai Havard  
Kate Hoey  
Kelvin Hopkins

Glenda Jackson  
Dr Lynne Jones  
Andrew Mackinlay  
Fiona Mactaggart  
Bob Marshall-Andrews  
John McDonnell  
Chris Mullin  
Gordon Prentice  
Alan Simpson  
Paul Truswell

*Note:* The Government's majority was reduced to only eight. Tom Harris was initially incorrectly recorded as voting against the government, his name having been confused with that of Evan Harris. The House authorities later amended both the online and bound editions of Hansard. Two former Labour MPs - Clare Short and Robert Wareing - also voted against the Government.



**[71]** 9 November 2009 (Div. 243):

Nine Labour MPs supported a Lords amendment to the Coroners and Justice Bill that would have maintained a 'free speech' defence for the new offence of incitement to hatred against persons on the grounds of their sexual orientation:

Joe Benton  
Jim Dobbin  
David Drew

Frank Field  
John Grogan  
Kate Hoey

Andrew Mackinlay  
Geraldine Smith  
David Taylor

*Note:* The Liberal Democrat frontbench line was to support the Government motion disagreeing with the Lords, but one – Sir Alan Beith – backed the Lords amendment.

**[72]** 9 November 2009 (Div. 244):

Two Labour MPs supported a Lords amendment to the Coroners and Justice Bill that sought to insert a clause requiring the Secretary of State to appoint an Independent Commissioner to monitor the detention and treatment of terrorist suspects:

Jeremy Corbyn  
John McDonnell

*Note:* The Conservative frontbench line was to abstain, but two Conservative MPs – Peter Bottomley and Philip Hollobone – voted against the Government motion in the no lobby.

**[73]** 10 November 2009 (Div. 245):

Twenty-two Labour MPs supported a Lords amendment to the Welfare Reform Bill that would have ensured that financial sanctions could not be imposed on lone parents in receipt of income support with a child under five if they failed to undertake work-related activity:

Diane Abbott  
Colin Burgon  
Martin Caton  
Katy Clark  
Ann Clwyd  
Jeremy Corbyn  
Jim Cousins  
Jon Cruddas

David Drew  
Paul Farrelly  
Paul Flynn  
John Grogan  
Kate Hoey  
Kelvin Hopkins  
Dr Lynne Jones  
Bob Marshall-Andrews

John McDonnell  
Gordon Prentice  
Linda Riordan  
David Taylor  
Paul Truswell  
Mike Wood

**[74]** 12 November 2009 (Div. 248):

During discussion of Lords amendments to the Coroners and Justice Bill, 12 Labour MPs supported a Conservative amendment that would have required approval from the Lord Chief Justice for secret inquiries:

Colin Challen  
Andrew Dismore  
David Drew  
Frank Field

Kate Hoey  
Kelvin Hopkins  
Glenda Jackson  
Dr Lynne Jones

John McDonnell  
Austin Mitchell  
Gordon Prentice  
Alan Simpson

*Note:* Denis MacShane, who spoke in the debate, abstained.

## II List of all Labour rebellions, 2008-2009

No. 2008-	No. 1997-	No. GB-	Title/Bill	Date	Size	Div. No.
1	600	114	Con amdt to Govt Business motion, doubling length of time for Speaker's Committee vote	08 December 2008	5	1
2	601	115	VAT from 17.5% to 15% (Lib Dem prayer)	17 December 2008	3	9
3	602	116	Coroners & Justice Bill (Lib Dem Reasoned Amdt on Second Reading)	26 January 2009	2	21
4	603	117	Draft Criminal Justice and Police Act 2001 (Amendment) Order 2009 (reclassification of cannabis)	26 January 2009	2	24
5	604	118	Heathrow (Third Runway) (Con Opposition Day motion)	28 January 2009	28	26
6	605	119	British Agriculture and Food Labelling (Con Opposition Day motion)	24 February 2009	1	40
7	606	120	Draft Prevention of Terrorism Act 2005 (Continuance in force of Sections 1-9) Order 2009 (control orders)	03 March 2009	16	49
8	607	121	Northern Ireland Bill (Con b/b amdt to Govt Allocation of Time motion)	04 March 2009	2	53
9	608	122	Second Strategic Energy Review (EU take note motion) (deferred division)	11 March 2009	1	58
10	609	123	Welfare Reform Bill (Report: Lab b/b New Clause, rate of Jobseeker's allowance for 18-25s)	17 March 2009	30	74
11	610	124	Welfare Reform Bill (Report: Lab b/b amdt: leave out 'imposing' and insert 'offering to')	17 March 2009	26	75
12	611	125	Welfare Reform Bill (Report: Con amdt, exempting single parents with child under five)	17 March 2009	29	76
13	612	126	Coroners & Justice Bill (Programme No. 3)	23 March 2009	2	82
14	613	127	Coroners & Justice Bill (Report: Lib Dem amdt, remove Clause 11: inquests without a jury)	23 March 2009	19	83
15	614	128	Coroners & Justice Bill (Report: Lab b/b amdt, incitement to hatred on grounds of sexual orientation)	24 March 2009	10	84
16	615	129	Coroners & Justice Bill (Third Reading)	24 March 2009	1	87
17	616	130	Iraq War Inquiry (Con Opposition Day motion)	25 March 2009	13	88
18	617	131	Iraq War Inquiry (Govt amdt to Con Opposition Day motion)	25 March 2009	12	89
19	618	132	Retrospective Rating on Firms Operating British ports (Con Prayer)	01 April 2009	4	95
20	619	133	Gurkha Settlement Rights (Lib Dem Opposition Day motion)	29 April 2009	27	104
21	620	134	Finance Bill (CWH: Lib Dem amdt to Clause 16: remote rural fuel discount scheme)	13 May 2009	1	126
22	621	135	Finance Bill (CWH: SNP amdt, reduce Bingo Duty from 22% to 15%)	13 May 2009	3	129
23	622	136	Mid-Staffordshire NHS Foundation Trust (Con Opposition Day)	18 May 2009	6	132
24	623	137	Policing and Crime Bill (Programme No. 2)	19 May 2009	4	133
25	624	138	Policing and Crime Bill (Report: Lib Dem New Clause, destruction of DNA samples)	19 May 2009	6	134
26	625	139	Policing and Crime Bill (Report: Lib Dem New Clause, decriminalise Prostitution under 18)	19 May 2009	11	136
27	626	140	Policing and Crime Bill (Report: Lib Dem New Clause, prostitutes known to be trafficked or coerced)	19 May 2009	12	137

28	627	141	Planning (National Policy Statements) (Lab b/b amdt, contentious statements subject to debate and vote)	20 May 2009	18	138
29	628	142	Planning (National Policy Statements) (Main Question)	20 May 2009	8	139
30	629	143	External Service (EU take note motion) (deferred division)	17 June 2009	1	151
31	630	144	Business Rates Supplements Bill (Lords amdts: firms operating British ports)	17 June 2009	8	153
32	631	145	Iraq Inquiry (Con Opposition Day motion)	24 June 2009	19	155
33	632	146	Iraq Inquiry (Govt amdt to Con Opposition Day motion)	24 June 2009	11	156
34	633	147	Parliamentary Standards Bill (Second Reading)	29 June 2009	1	167
35	634	148	Parliamentary Standards Bill (Programme motion)	29 June 2009	1	168
36	635	149	Parliamentary Standards Bill (CWH: Con amdt, IPSA's power to make disciplinary recommendations)	01 July 2009	6	175
37	636	150	Parliamentary Standards Bill (CWH: Con amdt, paid advocacy)	01 July 2009	1	177
38	637	151	Parliamentary Standards Bill (CWH: Clause 10 stand part)	01 July 2009	25	178
39	638	152	Parliamentary Standards Bill (Report: Con amdt, sunset clause)	01 July 2009	1	179
40	639	153	ID Cards (Con Opposition Day motion)	06 July 2009	4	182
41	640	154	ID Cards (Govt amdt to Con Opposition Day motion)	06 July 2009	9	183
42	641	155	Finance Bill (Report: Lab b/b New Clause, compensation for removal of the 10p rate of income tax)	07 July 2009	18	184
43	642	156	Finance Bill (Report: Lib Dem amdt, increase personal allowances from £6,475 to £10,000)	07 July 2009	1	186
44	643	157	Finance Bill (Report: Lib Dem amdt, reduce rates of alcoholic liquor duty by 2% per year)	07 July 2009	1	187
45	644	158	Draft Justice & Security (Northern Ireland) Act 2007 (Extension of non-jury trial provisions) (deferred division)	08 July 2009	3	188
46	645	159	Draft Identity Cards Act 2006 (Provision of Information without Consent) Regulations 2009 (deferred division)	08 July 2009	14	189
47	646	160	Draft Identity Cards Act 2006 (Information and Code of Practice on Penalties) Order 2009 (deferred division)	08 July 2009	14	190
48	647	161	Draft Identity Cards Act 2006 (Fees) Regulations 2009 (deferred division)	08 July 2009	13	191
49	648	162	Draft Identity Cards Act 2006 (Application and Issue of ID Card and Notification of Changes) Regulations 2009 (deferred division)	08 July 2009	14	192
50	649	163	Draft Identity Cards Act 2006 (Prescribed Information) Regulations 2009 (deferred division)	08 July 2009	14	193
51	650	164	Finance Bill (Report: SNP Amdt, reduce Bingo Duty from 22% to 15%)	08 July 2009	17	195
52	651	165	Draft Terrorism Act (Disapplication of Section 25) Order 2009	09 July 2009	5	196
53	652	166	Draft Council Tax Limitation (Maximum Amounts) (England) Order 2009	09 July 2009	2	197
54	653	167	Borders, Citizenship and Immigration Bill (Report: Lib Dem New Clause, Immigration Rules on Gurkhas)	14 July 2009	6	200
55	654	168	US-UK Extradition Treaty (Con Opposition Day motion)	15 July 2009	10	202
56	655	169	Parliamentary Standards Bill (Con b/b amdt to Lords amdt, sovereignty of Parliament)	21 July 2009	1	208
57	656	170	Health Bill (Report: Con New Clause, Purchase of Tobacco on Behalf of Children)	12 October 2009	3	210
58	657	171	Health Bill (Report: Con amdt, leave out clause 21, displays of tobacco products at point of sale)	12 October 2009	4	212

59	658	172	Local Democracy, Economic Development and Construction Bill (Report: PC New Clause, Insolvency Protection)	13 October 2009	4	213
60	659	173	Local Democracy, Economic Development and Construction Bill (Report: Lab b/b amdt, Committee System)	13 October 2009	14	214
61	660	174	Local Democracy, Economic Development and Construction Bill (Report: Lab b/b New Clause, Local Spending Reports)	13 October 2009	10	215
62	661	175	Equitable Life (Lib Dem Opposition Day motion)	21 October 2009	18	228
63	662	176	Climate Change (Lib Dem Opposition Day motion)	21 October 2009	12	229
64	663	177	Marine and Coastal Access Bill (Report: Lab b/b amdt, strengthen power to designate Marine Conservation Zones)	26 October 2009	11	230
65	664	178	Local Spending Reports (Con Opposition Day motion)	28 October 2009	2	232
66	665	179	Constitutional Reform and Governance Bill (Programme)	03 November 2009	4	234
67	666	180	Constitutional Reform and Governance Bill (CWH: Lib Dem amdt, include GCHQ Cheltenham)	03 November 2009	4	235
68	667	181	Constitutional Reform and Governance Bill (CWH: Con amdt, CAG's pay etc to be published online)	03 November 2009	1	239
69	668	177	Coroners and Justice Bill (Programme No. 4)	09 November 2009	1	240
70	669	178	Coroners and Justice Bill (Lords amdts: Lab b/b amdt, coroner's inquest in favour of secret inquiry)	09 November 2009	30	241
71	670	179	Coroners and Justice Bill (Lords amdts: 'free speech' defence)	09 November 2009	9	243
72	671	180	Coroners and Justice Bill (Lords amdts: Independent Commissioner)	09 November 2009	2	244
73	672	181	Welfare Reform Bill (Lords amdts: financial sanctions on lone parents with young children)	10 November 2009	22	245
74	673	182	Coroners and Justice Bill (Lords amdts: secret inquiry requires approval of Lord Chief Justice)	12 November 2009	12	248

### III Major rebellions against the party whip, by issue/bill

#### Coroners and Justice Bill

	Lib Dem Reasoned Amdt, Second Reading (Div. 21)	Programme No. 3 (Div. 82)	Inquest without jury (Div. 83)	Free speech (sexual orientation) (Div. 84)	Third Reading (Div. 87)	Programme No. 4 (Div. 240)	Secret inquiries (Div. 241)	Free speech (sexual orientation) (Div. 243)	Independent Commissioner (Div. 244)	Lord Chief Justice for secret inquiries (Div. 248)
Abbott, Diane			X				X			
Allen, Graham							X			
Austin, John							X			
Benton, Joe								X		
Buck, Karen							X			
Burgon, Colin			X				X			
Campbell, Ronnie			X							
Caton, Martin							X			
Challen, Colin							X			X
Clark, Katy							X			
Corbyn, Jeremy	X	X	X				X		X	
Dismore, Andrew			X				X			X
Dobbin, Jim								X		
Dobson, Frank			X				X			
Drew, David				X			X	X		X
Farrelly, Paul					X		X			
Field, Frank				X			X	X		X
Fisher, Mark			X				X			
Gerrard, Neil			X				X			
Grogan, John			X	X			X	X		
Harris, Tom				X						
Havard, Dai			X				X			
Hoey, Kate				X			X	X		X
Hopkins, Kelvin			X				X			X
Jackson, Glenda			X				X			X
Jones, Dr Lynne			X				X			X
Kilfoyle, Peter			X	X						
Mackinlay, Andrew			X				X	X		
Mactaggart, Fiona							X			
Marshall-Andrews, Bob						X	X			
McDonnell, John	X	X	X				X		X	X
Mitchell, Austin										X
Mullin, Chris							X			
Pope, Greg				X						

Prentice, Gordon			X				X			X
Simpson, Alan			X				X			X
Smith, Geraldine				X				X		
Taylor, David				X				X		
Truswell, Paul			X				X			
Wright, Dr Tony				X						

## Heathrow and Gurkhas

	Heathrow (Con Opp motion) (Div. 26)	Gurkhas (LD Opp Day motion) (Div. 104)
Abbott, Diane	X	X
Cawsey, Ian		X
Cohen, Harry	X	X
Corbyn, Jeremy	X	X
Cousins, Jim	X	
Dobson, Frank	X	
Drew, David	X	
Farrelly, Paul		X
Field, Frank	X	
Fisher, Mark		X
Flynn, Paul	X	
Gerrard, Neil		X
Gibson, Dr Ian	X	
Grogan, John	X	
Hoey, Kate	X	X
Hopkins, Kelvin	X	X
Humble, Joan		X
Jackson, Glenda		X
Jones, Dr Lynne	X	
Kilfoyle, Peter	X	
Mackinlay, Andrew	X	X
Marsden, Gordon		X
Marshall-Andrews, Bob	X	X
McDonnell, John	X	X
Meacher, Michael	X	
McIssac, Shona		X
Morgan, Julie		X
Mudie, George	X	
Mullin, Chris	X	
Palmer, Dr Nick		X
Pound, Stephen		X
Prentice, Gordon	X	
Raynsford, Nick	X	X
Reed, Andy		X
Riordan, Linda		X



Salter, Martin	X	
Sharma, Virendra	X	
Simpson, Alan	X	X
Slaughter, Andrew	X	
Smith, Andrew	X	X
Taylor, David	X	A
Truswell, Paul		X
Vaz, Keith		X
Wood, Mike		X

## Welfare Reform Bill

	Abolish Jobseeker lower rate for 18-25s (Div. 74)	Offer not 'imposition' (Div. 75)	Exclude parent with child under five (Div. 76)	Exclude parent with child under five (Div. 245)
Abbott, Diane				X
Burgon, Colin	X	X	X	X
Campbell, Ronnie	X	X	X	
Caton, Martin	X	X		X
Clark, Katy	X	X	X	X
Clelland, David			X	
Clwyd, Ann				X
Cook, Frank	X	X	X	
Corbyn, Jeremy	X	X	X	X
Cousins, Jim	X	X	X	X
Cruddas, Jon			X	X
Cummings, John		X	X	
Dobson, Frank	X	X	X	
Drew, David	X	X	X	X
Farrelly, Paul				X
Flynn, Paul	X	X	X	X
Gerrard, Neil	X	X	X	
Gibson, Dr Ian	X		X	
Godsiff, Roger	X			
Grogan, John	X	X		X
Havard, Dai	X	X	X	
Hoey, Kate	X	X	X	X
Hopkins, Kelvin	X	X	X	X
Iddon, Dr Brian	X			
Jones, Dr Lynne	X	X	X	X
Kilfoyle, Peter	X		X	
Marshall-Andrews, Bob				X
Martlew, Eric	X			
McDonnell, John	X	X	X	X
Meacher, Michael			X	
Mitchell, Austin	X			
Mudie, George			X	
Prentice, Gordon	X	X	X	X
Riordan, Linda	X	X	X	X
Robinson, Geoffrey			A	

Simpson, Alan	X	X	X	
Skinner, Dennis	X	X		
Taylor, David	X	X	X	X
Truswell, Paul	X	X	X	X
Winnick, David		X	X	
Wood, Mike	X	X	X	X

## Parliamentary Standards Bill

	Second Rearing (Div. 167)	Programme (Div. 168)	IPSA (Div. 175)	Ban paid advocacy (Div. 177)	Court evidence (Div. 178)	Sunset clause (Div. 179)	Sovereignty (Div. 208)
Abbott, Diane			X		X		
Austin, John					X		
Beckett, Margaret					X		
Borrow, David					X		
Corbyn, Jeremy					X		
Dismore, Andrew					X		
Dowd, Jim					X		
Drew, David					X		
Field, Frank	X					X	X
Fisher, Mark			X		X		
Flynn, Paul					X		
Henderson, Doug			X				
Hoey, Kate		X					
Hopkins, Kelvin			A		X		
Jones, Dr Lynne					X		
Love, Andy					X		
Mactaggart, Fiona					X		
Meale, Alan			X		X		
Naysmith, Dr Doug					X		
Pope, Greg					X		
Prentice, Gordon					X		
Reid, John					X		
Sharma, Virendra					X		
Simpson, Alan			X	X	X		
Stuart, Gisela			X		X		
Taylor, David					X		
Vis, Dr Rudi					X		
Wood, Mike					X		

## IV The Labour rebels, 2005-2009

a) Sorted by number of rebellions in 2008-2009

Name of MP	Votes against the whip				Total
	08-09	07-08	06-07	05-06	
McDonnell, John	46	44	21	63	174
Corbyn, Jeremy	45	57	31	60	193
Simpson, Alan	41	29	21	40	131
Drew, David	33	48	14	13	108
Jones, Dr Lynne	33	23	16	41	113
Hoey, Kate	27	34	11	32	104
Hopkins, Kelvin	24	43	18	36	121
Prentice, Gordon	23	14	8	17	62
Mackinlay, Andrew	21	9	2	2	34
Taylor, David	21	25	7	20	73
Field, Frank	17	16	5	6	44
Abbott, Diane	16	13	5	19	53
Flynn, Paul	15	15	5	21	56
Gerrard, Neil	15	7	5	13	40
Truswell, Paul	15	14	4	8	41
Godsiff, Roger	13	12	2	10	37
Wood, Mike	13	16	9	22	60
Marshall-Andrews, Bob	12	14	9	35	70
Fisher, Mark	11	13	9	34	67
Riordan, Linda	10	14	5	21	50
Grogan, John	9	11	7	14	41
Challen, Colin	8	6	1	8	23
Farrelly, Paul	8	6	3	5	23
Havard, Dai	8	12	4	5	29
Burgon, Colin	7	13	7	7	34
Clark, Katy	7	12	6	18	43
Mitchell, Austin	7	18	5	3	33
Winnick, David	7	6	3	6	22
Campbell, Ronnie	6	9	3	4	22
Devine, Jim	6	0	2	4	12
Dobson, Frank	6	6	4	10	26
Gibson, Dr Ian	6	9	9	24	48
Jackson, Glenda	6	3	5	33	47
Kilfoyle, Peter	6	9	5	11	31
<i>Todd, Mark</i>	6	0	0	0	6
Caton, Martin	5	7	6	6	24
Cousins, Jim	5	11	3	7	26
Owen, Albert	5	2	1	1	9
Skinner, Dennis	5	12	4	18	39
<i>Cawsey, Ian</i>	4	0	0	0	4

Dismore, Andrew	4	8	2	3	17
Iddon, Dr Brian	4	1	0	1	6
<i>McIssac, Shona</i>	4	0	0	0	4
Soulsby, Sir Peter	4	4	4	8	20
Vaz, Keith	4	4	3	3	14
Cohen, Harry	3	5	5	13	26
Cook, Frank	3	13	5	4	25
Cummings, John	3	7	2	1	13
Meacher, Michael	3	9	10	7	29
Austin, John	2	1	3	9	15
Clelland, David	2	0	0	3	5
Cruddas, Jon	2	4	4	4	14
Hall, Patrick	2	0	3	3	8
<i>Harris, Tom</i>	2	0	0	0	2
Lazarowicz, Mark	2	0	2	1	5
Mactaggart, Fiona	2	2	0	0	4
Martlew, Eric	2	1	0	0	3
Meale, Alan	2	3	3	1	9
Morgan, Julie	2	1	4	2	9
Mudie, George	2	4	2	12	20
Mullin, Chris	2	4	3	2	11
Palmer, Dr Nick	2	1	0	0	3
Pope, Greg	2	2	0	0	4
Raynsford, Nick	2	0	0	2	4
<i>Sharma, Virendra</i>	2	0	0	0	2
Smith, Andrew	2	0	2	0	4
Smith, Geraldine	2	6	2	9	19
Strang, Dr Gavin	2	0	2	5	9
Stuart, Gisela	2	7	1	0	10
Walley, Joan	2	2	3	4	11
Wright, Dr Tony	2	0	3	2	7
<i>Allen, Graham</i>	1	0	0	0	1
<i>Banks, Gordon</i>	1	0	0	0	1
<i>Beckett, Margaret</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Benton, Joe	1	3	3	2	9
<i>Borrow, David</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Buck, Karen	1	0	2	0	3
Clwyd, Ann	1	1	0	0	2
Curtis-Thomas, Claire	1	3	0	0	4
Dean, Janet	1	0	3	1	5
<i>Dhanda, Parmjit</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Dobbin, Jim	1	4	3	5	13
<i>Dowd, Jim</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Ellman, Louise	1	0	0	1	2
Henderson, Doug	1	0	0	4	5
Humble, Joan	1	0	1	4	6
Illsley, Eric	1	1	1	2	5

<i>Kidney, David</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Love, Andy	1	0	0	7	8
Marsden, Gordon	1	1	1	0	3
Murphy, Denis	1	3	2	1	7
Naysmith, Dr Doug	1	2	2	0	5
Pound, Stephen	1	0	2	0	3
Prosser, Gwyn	1	1	1	3	6
Reed, Andy	1	1	0	0	2
<i>Reid, John</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Salter, Martin	1	0	1	1	3
Sarwar, Mohammad	1	0	2	0	3
<i>Slaughter, Andrew</i>	1	0	0	0	1
<i>Taylor, Dari</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Vis, Dr Rudi	1	1	2	7	11
Wright, Anthony	1	1	2	2	6
Begg, Anne	0	0	3	0	3
Berry, Dr Roger	0	0	2	3	5
Betts, Clive	0	1	1	3	5
Burden, Richard	0	2	4	5	11
Butler, Dawn	0	0	1	0	1
Chaytor, David	0	1	2	3	6
Clapham, Michael	0	6	4	16	26
Clarke, Charles	0	0	1	0	1
Clarke, Tom	0	3	1	0	4
Connarty, Michael	0	3	2	3	8
Crausby, David	0	0	0	3	3
Cryer, Ann	0	4	4	4	12
Davidson, Ian	0	26	2	9	37
Doran, Frank	0	0	2	1	3
Eagle, Angela	0	0	0	1	1
Efford, Clive	0	0	2	5	7
Ennis, Jeff	0	0	2	0	2
Etherington, Bill	0	4	2	4	10
Flello, Robert	0	1	0	0	1
Foster, Michael Jabez	0	0	2	0	2
Griffith, Nia	0	0	4	0	4
Griffiths, Nigel	0	0	1	0	1
Hamilton, David	0	4	3	7	14
Hamilton, Fabian	0	1	2	2	5
Hepburn, Stephen	0	1	0	0	1
Heyes, David	0	2	4	6	12
Howarth, George	0	1	0	1	2
Hoyle, Lindsay	0	3	1	2	6
James, Sian	0	0	2	2	4
Jenkins, Brian	0	1	0	1	2
Jones, Helen	0	0	1	6	7
Keen, Alan	0	0	0	1	1

Kelly, Ruth	0	1	0	0	1
Khan, Sadiq	0	0	0	2	2
Lepper, David	0	0	3	0	3
Lloyd, Tony	0	0	2	5	7
Mallaber, Judy	0	0	1	0	1
Marris, Rob	0	0	0	1	1
McCafferty, Christine	0	1	3	5	9
McGovern, Jim	0	0	2	1	3
McKechin, Ann	0	0	2	0	2
McKenna, Rosemary	0	1	0	0	1
Miller, Andrew	0	1	0	0	1
Osborne, Sandra	0	0	3	0	3
Picking, Anne (Moffat)	0	3	0	0	3
Purchase, Ken	0	0	2	7	9
Robinson, Geoffrey	0	1	0	1	2
Rooney, Terry	0	0	1	0	1
Ruane, Chris	0	0	1	0	1
Ruddock, Joan	0	0	3	1	4
Sheerman, Barry	0	1	1	0	2
Sheridan, Jim	0	2	0	0	2
Singh, Marsha	0	1	2	1	4
Smith, John	0	0	0	8	8
Spellar, John	0	2	0	0	2
Stewart, Ian	0	1	3	1	5
Stoate, Dr Howard	0	0	1	0	1
Stringer, Graham	0	5	2	0	7
Thornberry, Emily	0	2	1	2	5
Trickett, Jon	0	5	4	11	20
Turner, Dr Desmond	0	2	3	5	10
Williams, Alan	0	0	0	3	3
Williams, Betty	0	0	3	1	4
Dunwoody, Gwyneth	N/A	9	2	15	26
Marshall, David	N/A	9	1	0	10
Short, Clare	N/A	N/A	N/A	34	34
Wareing, Robert	N/A	N/A	12	42	54

*Notes:* Italics indicates MPs whose first votes against the whip during the 2005 Parliament came in the fourth session. Figures are for votes cast against the whip. The figure for Clare Short only includes votes up to 20 October 2006; Gwyneth Dunwoody died 17 April 2008; David Marshall resigned 30 June 2008; Robert Wareing had resigned the whip by the start of the 2007-08 session, that is, 6 November 2007; David Chaytor had the whip suspended 16 May 09; Dr Ian Gibson resigned 5 June 09; Jim Devine was deselected and lost the whip 16 June 09.



b) Sorted alphabetically

Name of MP	Votes against the whip				Total
	08-09	07-08	06-07	05-06	
Abbott, Diane	16	13	5	19	53
<i>Allen, Graham</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Austin, John	2	1	3	9	15
<i>Banks, Gordon</i>	1	0	0	0	1
<i>Beckett, Margaret</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Begg, Anne	0	0	3	0	3
Benton, Joe	1	3	3	2	9
Berry, Dr Roger	0	0	2	3	5
Betts, Clive	0	1	1	3	5
<i>Borrow, David</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Buck, Karen	1	0	2	0	3
Burden, Richard	0	2	4	5	11
Burgon, Colin	7	13	7	7	34
Butler, Dawn	0	0	1	0	1
Campbell, Ronnie	6	9	3	4	22
Caton, Martin	5	7	6	6	24
<i>Cawsey, Ian</i>	4	0	0	0	4
Challen, Colin	8	6	1	8	23
Chaytor, David	0	1	2	3	6
Clapham, Michael	0	6	4	16	26
Clark, Katy	7	12	6	18	43
Clarke, Charles	0	0	1	0	1
Clarke, Tom	0	3	1	0	4
Clelland, David	2	0	0	3	5
Clwyd, Ann	1	1	0	0	2
Cohen, Harry	3	5	5	13	26
Connarty, Michael	0	3	2	3	8
Cook, Frank	3	13	5	4	25
Corbyn, Jeremy	45	57	31	60	193
Cousins, Jim	5	11	3	7	26
Crausby, David	0	0	0	3	3
Cruddas, Jon	2	4	4	4	14
Cryer, Ann	0	4	4	4	12
Cummings, John	3	7	2	1	13
Curtis-Thomas, Claire	1	3	0	0	4
Davidson, Ian	0	26	2	9	37
Dean, Janet	1	0	3	1	5
Devine, Jim	6	0	2	4	12
<i>Dhanda, Parmjit</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Dismore, Andrew	4	8	2	3	17
Dobbin, Jim	1	4	3	5	13
Dobson, Frank	6	6	4	10	26

Doran, Frank	0	0	2	1	3
<i>Dowd, Jim</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Drew, David	33	48	14	13	108
Dunwoody, Gwyneth	N/A	9	2	15	26
Eagle, Angela	0	0	0	1	1
Efford, Clive	0	0	2	5	7
Ellman, Louise	1	0	0	1	2
Ennis, Jeff	0	0	2	0	2
Etherington, Bill	0	4	2	4	10
Farrelly, Paul	8	6	3	5	22
Field, Frank	17	16	5	6	44
Fisher, Mark	11	13	9	34	67
Flello, Robert	0	1	0	0	1
Flynn, Paul	15	15	5	21	56
Foster, Michael Jabez	0	0	2	0	2
Gerrard, Neil	15	7	5	13	40
Gibson, Dr Ian	6	9	9	24	48
Godsiff, Roger	13	12	2	10	37
Griffith, Nia	0	0	4	0	4
Griffiths, Nigel	0	0	1	0	1
Grogan, John	9	11	7	14	41
Hall, Patrick	2	0	3	3	8
Hamilton, David	0	4	3	7	14
Hamilton, Fabian	0	1	2	2	5
<i>Harris, Tom</i>	2	0	0	0	2
Havard, Dai	8	12	4	5	29
Henderson, Doug	1	0	0	4	5
Hepburn, Stephen	0	1	0	0	1
Heyes, David	0	2	4	6	12
Hoey, Kate	27	34	11	32	104
Hopkins, Kelvin	24	43	18	36	121
Howarth, George	0	1	0	1	2
Hoyle, Lindsay	0	3	1	2	6
Humble, Joan	1	0	1	4	6
Iddon, Dr Brian	4	1	0	1	6
Illsley, Eric	1	1	1	2	5
Jackson, Glenda	6	3	5	33	47
James, Sian	0	0	2	2	4
Jenkins, Brian	0	1	0	1	2
Jones, Dr Lynne	33	23	16	41	113
Jones, Helen	0	0	1	6	7
Keen, Alan	0	0	0	1	1
Kelly, Ruth	0	1	0	0	1
Khan, Sadiq	0	0	0	2	2
<i>Kidney, David</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Kilfoyle, Peter	6	9	5	11	31

Lazarowicz, Mark	2	0	2	1	5
Lepper, David	0	0	3	0	3
Lloyd, Tony	0	0	2	5	7
Love, Andy	1	0	0	7	8
Mackinlay, Andrew	21	9	2	2	34
Mactaggart, Fiona	2	2	0	0	4
Mallaber, Judy	0	0	1	0	1
Marris, Rob	0	0	0	1	1
Marsden, Gordon	1	1	1	0	3
Marshall, David	N/A	9	1	0	10
Marshall-Andrews, Bob	12	14	9	35	70
Martlew, Eric	2	1	0	0	3
McCafferty, Christine	0	1	3	5	9
McDonnell, John	46	44	21	63	174
McGovern, Jim	0	0	2	1	3
McIssac, Shona	4	0	0	0	4
McKechin, Ann	0	0	2	0	2
McKenna, Rosemary	0	1	0	0	1
Meacher, Michael	3	9	10	7	29
Meale, Alan	2	3	3	1	9
Miller, Andrew	0	1	0	0	1
Mitchell, Austin	7	18	5	3	33
Morgan, Julie	2	1	4	2	9
Mudie, George	2	4	2	12	20
Mullin, Chris	2	4	3	2	11
Murphy, Denis	1	3	2	1	7
Naysmith, Dr Doug	1	2	2	0	5
Osborne, Sandra	0	0	3	0	3
Owen, Albert	5	2	1	1	9
Palmer, Dr Nick	2	1	0	0	3
Picking, Anne (Moffat)	0	3	0	0	3
Pope, Greg	2	2	0	0	4
Pound, Stephen	1	0	2	0	3
Prentice, Gordon	23	14	8	17	62
Prosser, Gwyn	1	1	1	3	6
Purchase, Ken	0	0	2	7	9
Raynsford, Nick	2	0	0	2	4
Reed, Andy	1	1	0	0	2
Reid, John	1	0	0	0	1
Riordan, Linda	10	14	5	21	50
Robinson, Geoffrey	0	1	0	1	2
Rooney, Terry	0	0	1	0	1
Ruane, Chris	0	0	1	0	1
Ruddock, Joan	0	0	3	1	4
Salter, Martin	1	0	1	1	3
Sarwar, Mohammad	1	0	2	0	3

<i>Sharma, Virendra</i>	2	0	0	0	2
Sheerman, Barry	0	1	1	0	2
Sheridan, Jim	0	2	0	0	2
Short, Clare	N/A	N/A	N/A	34	34
Simpson, Alan	41	29	21	40	131
Singh, Marsha	0	1	2	1	4
Skinner, Dennis	5	12	4	18	39
<i>Slaughter, Andrew</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Smith, Andrew	2	0	2	0	4
Smith, Geraldine	2	6	2	9	19
Smith, John	0	0	0	8	8
Soulsby, Sir Peter	4	4	4	8	20
Spellar, John	0	2	0	0	2
Stewart, Ian	0	1	3	1	5
Stoate, Dr Howard	0	0	1	0	1
Strang, Dr Gavin	2	0	2	5	9
Stringer, Graham	0	5	2	0	7
Stuart, Gisela	2	7	1	0	10
<i>Taylor, Dari</i>	1	0	0	0	1
Taylor, David	21	25	7	20	73
Thornberry, Emily	0	2	1	2	5
<i>Todd, Mark</i>	6	0	0	0	6
Trickett, Jon	0	5	4	11	20
Truswell, Paul	15	14	4	8	41
Turner, Dr Desmond	0	2	3	5	10
Vaz, Keith	4	4	3	3	14
Vis, Dr Rudi	1	1	2	7	11
Walley, Joan	2	2	3	4	11
Wareing, Robert	N/A	N/A	12	42	54
Williams, Alan	0	0	0	3	3
Williams, Betty	0	0	3	1	4
Winnick, David	7	6	3	6	22
Wood, Mike	13	16	9	22	60
Wright, Anthony	1	1	2	2	6
Wright, Dr Tony	2	0	3	2	7

*Notes:* Italics indicates MPs whose first votes against the whip during the 2005 Parliament came in the fourth session. Figures are for votes cast against the whip. The figure for Clare Short only includes votes up to 20 October 2006; Gwyneth Dunwoody died 17 April 2008; David Marshall resigned 30 June 2008; Robert Wareing had resigned the whip by the start of the 2007-08 session, that is, 6 November 2007; David Chaytor had the whip suspended 16 May 09; Dr Ian Gibson resigned 5 June 09; Jim Devine was deselected and lost the whip 16 June 09.